

13 Cal.Rptr.3d 68 / 89 P.3d 381 / 32 Cal.4th 1198

Joshua Lee HAYNES, Plaintiff and Appellant,

v.

FARMERS INSURANCE EXCHANGE, Defendant and Respondent.

No. S104851.

Supreme Court of California.

May 17, 2004.

In Haynes v. Farmers Insurance Exchange, the California Supreme Court ruled that a Farmers Insurance policy provision limiting coverage for permissive users was unenforceable because the language was inconspicuous and vague, requiring clarity and conspicuousness in insurance policy language.

- **The Case:** Joshua Lee Haynes sued Farmers Insurance Exchange for declaratory relief, arguing that a provision in an automobile liability policy limiting coverage for permissive users should not be enforced because the clause was inconspicuous and vague.
- **Plaintiff's Injury:** Haynes was injured while a passenger in a car driven by a permissive user, Christopher Morrow, and subsequently sued Morrow and the car owner, Gallahair, to recover damages.
- **The Issue:** The case centered on whether a provision within Farmers Insurance's "E-Z Reader Car Policy" sufficiently disclosed limitations on coverage for permissive users.
- **Haynes's Argument:** Haynes argued that the limitation was neither clear nor conspicuous within the policy documentation and, therefore, unenforceable.
- **Farmers' Defense:** Farmers defended by arguing that coverage was defined by the language in endorsement S9064, which limited permissive user coverage.
- **Trial Court's Decision:** The trial court initially granted Farmers' motion for summary judgment, but the Supreme Court reversed this decision.
- **The Supreme Court's Ruling:** The Supreme Court of California affirmed that the limitation was unenforceable because the language was not clear and conspicuous.
- **Consequences:** The ruling emphasized the importance of clarity and conspicuousness in insurance policy language, particularly concerning limitations on coverage.
- **Endorsement S9064:** The specific endorsement in question was S9064, which limited permissive user coverage.